

A Appendix: Detail calculation for Sections 2 and 3

This part is a supplement to Sections 2 and 3 and contains detailed proof for referees' convenience(only for review process).

A.1 Calculation for the proof of Theorem 2.2

Verification of A_1 :

$$\begin{aligned}
A_1 &= \sum_{c_1, c_3, c_4=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p x_{c_1 c_2} \psi_{c_3} o_{j c_3} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \frac{o_{c_2 b} \{o_{ib} o_{c_4 c_3} x_{c_1 c_4} + o_{c_4 b} o_{ic_3} x_{c_1 c_4}\}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \frac{o_{c_2 b} \{o_{ib} o_{c_4 c_3} x_{c_1 c_4} + o_{c_4 b} o_{ic_3} x_{c_1 c_4}\}}{\ell_{c_3}} \right\} \\
&= \sum_{c_3=1}^n \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \frac{\psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} (o_{ib} o_{j c_3} \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{bc_3} + o_{ic_3} o_{j c_3} \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{bb}) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \frac{\psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3}} (o_{ib} o_{j c_3} \{\mathbf{O}'_2 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{bc_3} + o_{ic_3} o_{j c_3} \{\mathbf{O}'_2 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_2\}_{bb}) \right\} \\
&= \sum_{c_3=1}^n o_{ic_3} o_{j c_3} \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \frac{\ell_b \psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of A_2 :

$$\begin{aligned}
A_2 &= \sum_{c_1, c_3, c_4=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p x_{c_1 c_2} \psi_{c_3} o_{c_2 c_3} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \frac{o_{j b} \{o_{ib} o_{c_4 c_3} x_{c_1 c_4} + o_{c_4 b} o_{ic_3} x_{c_1 c_4}\}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \frac{o_{j b} \{o_{ib} o_{c_4 c_3} x_{c_1 c_4} + o_{c_4 b} o_{ic_3} x_{c_1 c_4}\}}{\ell_{c_3}} \right\} \\
&= \sum_{b=1}^n \sum_{c_3 \neq b}^n \frac{\psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} (o_{ib} o_{j b} \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{c_3 c_3} + o_{ic_3} o_{j b} \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{c_3 b}) \\
&\quad + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_3=1}^n \frac{\psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3}} (o_{ib} o_{j b} \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{c_3 c_3} + o_{ic_3} o_{j b} \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_2\}_{c_3 b}) \\
&= \sum_{b=1}^n o_{ib} o_{j b} \sum_{c_3 \neq b}^n \frac{\ell_{c_3} \psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p o_{ib} o_{j b} \sum_{c_3=1}^n \psi_{c_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of A_3 :

$$\begin{aligned}
A_3 &= \sum_{c_1, c_3, c_4, m=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p x_{c_1 c_2} o_{c_2 c_3} o_{j c_3} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_3}}{\partial \ell_m} o_{c_4 m} o_{i m} x_{c_1 c_4} \\
&= 2 \sum_{c_3, m=1}^n o_{i m} o_{j c_3} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_3}}{\partial \ell_m} \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{c_3 m} = 2 \sum_{c_3=1}^n o_{i c_3} o_{j c_3} \ell_{c_3} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_3}}{\partial \ell_{c_3}}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

A.2 Calculation for the proof of Theorem 2.3

Verification of $T_{ic_3}^{(11)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{ic_3}^{(11)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p x_{c_1 i} \psi_{c_5} o_{c_3 c_5} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{c_2 b} \{o_{c_2 b} o_{c_6 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6} + o_{c_6 b} o_{c_2 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{c_2 b} \{o_{c_2 b} o_{c_6 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6} + o_{c_6 b} o_{c_2 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \{\mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1 - \ell_b}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n - \ell_b}) \mathbf{O}'_1\}_{ic_3} \\
&\quad + (p-n) \{\mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1}, \dots, \frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1\}_{ic_3} \\
&= \{\mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_1 \psi_1}{\ell_1 - \ell_b}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_n \psi_n}{\ell_n - \ell_b}) \mathbf{O}'_1\}_{ic_3} + (p-n) \{\mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\psi_1, \dots, \psi_n) \mathbf{O}'_1\}_{ic_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

The second equality can be seen as follows: Summing over c_2 from 1 to p , we see that

$$\sum_{c_2=1}^p o_{c_2 b} o_{c_2 b} = \delta_{bb} \text{ and } \sum_{c_2=1}^p o_{c_2 b} o_{c_2 c_5} = \delta_{bc_5} = 0 \text{ for } c_5 \neq b.$$

□

Verification of $T_{ic_3}^{(12)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{ic_3}^{(12)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p x_{c_1 i} \psi_{c_5} o_{c_2 c_5} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{c_3 b} \{o_{c_2 b} o_{c_6 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6} + o_{c_6 b} o_{c_2 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{c_3 b} \{o_{c_2 b} o_{c_6 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6} + o_{c_6 b} o_{c_2 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \{ \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1 \}_{ic_3} \\
&\quad + \{ \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1}, \dots, \frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{O}_2 \mathbf{O}'_2 \}_{ic_3} \\
&\quad + \{ \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_2 \mathbf{O}'_2 \}_{ic_3} \text{Tr}(\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1}, \dots, \frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1) \\
&= \{ \mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_1 \psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_n \psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1 \}_{ic_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of $T_{ic_3}^{(13)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{ic_3}^{(13)} &= 2 \sum_{c_1, c_5, m=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p x_{c_1 i} o_{c_2 c_5} o_{c_3 c_5} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_5}}{\partial \ell_m} \sum_{c_6=1}^p o_{c_6 m} x_{c_1 c_6} o_{c_2 m} \\
&= 2 \sum_{c_1, c_5}^n x_{c_1 i} o_{c_3 c_5} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_5}}{\partial \ell_{c_5}} o_{c_6 c_5} x_{c_1 c_6} \\
&= \{ \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(2 \frac{\partial \psi_1}{\partial \ell_1}, \dots, 2 \frac{\partial \psi_n}{\partial \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1 \}_{ic_3} \\
&= \{ \mathbf{O}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(2 \ell_1 \frac{\partial \psi_1}{\partial \ell_1}, \dots, 2 \ell_n \frac{\partial \psi_n}{\partial \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1 \}_{ic_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of $T_{c_4c_3}^{(21)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4c_3}^{(21)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_2, i=1}^p x_{c_1i} \tilde{f}_{c_2c_3} o_{ic_5} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{c_4b} \{o_{c_2b} o_{c_6c_5} x_{c_1c_6} + o_{c_6b} o_{c_2c_5} x_{c_1c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{c_4b} \{o_{c_2b} o_{c_6c_5} x_{c_1c_6} + o_{c_6b} o_{c_2c_5} x_{c_1c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \sum_{c_5=1}^n \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n o_{c_4b} o_{c_2b} \tilde{f}_{c_2c_3} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} + \sum_{c_5=1}^n \sum_{b=n+1}^p o_{c_4b} o_{c_2b} \tilde{f}_{c_2c_3} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \\
&= \{\mathbf{O}_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1 \tilde{\mathbf{F}}\}_{c_4c_3} + \{\mathbf{O}_2 \mathbf{O}'_2 \tilde{\mathbf{F}}\}_{c_4c_3} \sum_{c_5=1}^n \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \\
&= \{\mathbf{O}_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_1 \psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_1 \psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1\}_{c_4c_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

The second equality can be seen as follows: Summing over c_6 and i from 1 to p and c_1 over from 1 to n , we can see that $\sum_{c_5, i=1}^p \sum_{c_1=1}^n o_{c_6c_5} x_{c_1c_6} x_{c_1i} o_{ic_5} = \ell_{c_5}$ and $\sum_{c_5, i=1}^p \sum_{c_1=1}^n o_{c_6b} x_{c_1c_6} x_{c_1i} o_{ic_5} = \ell_{c_5} = \delta_{bc_5} \ell_{c_5} = 0$ for $c_5 \neq b$. \square

Verification of $T_{c_4c_3}^{(22)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4c_3}^{(22)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_2, i=1}^p x_{c_1i} \tilde{f}_{c_2c_3} o_{c_4c_5} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{ib} \{o_{c_2b} o_{c_6c_5} x_{c_1c_6} + o_{c_6b} o_{c_2c_5} x_{c_1c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{o_{ib} \{o_{c_2b} o_{c_6c_5} x_{c_1c_6} + o_{c_6b} o_{c_2c_5} x_{c_1c_6}\}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \{\mathbf{O}_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_b \psi_1}{(\ell_1 - \ell_b) \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_b \psi_n}{(\ell_n - \ell_b) \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1 \tilde{\mathbf{F}}\}_{c_4c_3} \\
&= \{\mathbf{O}_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_b \psi_1^2}{(\ell_1 - \ell_b) \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_b \psi_n^2}{(\ell_n - \ell_b) \ell_n}) \mathbf{O}'_1\}_{c_4c_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

The second equality can be seen as follows: Summing over c_6 and i from 1 to p and over c_1 from 1 to n , we can see that $\sum_{c_6, i=1}^p \sum_{c_1=1}^n o_{c_6c_5} x_{c_1c_6} x_{c_1i} o_{ib} = \{\mathbf{O}'_1 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_1\}_{c_5b} = \delta_{c_5b} \ell_b = 0$ for $c_5 \neq b$, and $\sum_{c_6, i=1}^p \sum_{c_1=1}^n o_{c_6b} x_{c_1c_6} x_{c_1i} o_{ib} = \{\mathbf{O}'_2 \mathbf{X}' \mathbf{X} \mathbf{O}_2\}_{bb} = 0$ for $b = n+1, \dots, p$. \square

Verification of $T_{c_4c_3}^{(23)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4c_3}^{(23)} &= 2 \sum_{c_1, c_5, m=1}^n \sum_{c_2, i=1}^p x_{c_1i} \tilde{f}_{c_2c_3} o_{c_4c_5} o_{ic_5} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_m} \left(\frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right) \sum_{c_6=1}^p o_{c_6m} x_{c_1c_6} o_{c_2m} \\
&= 2 \sum_{c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p \ell_{c_5} \tilde{f}_{c_2c_3} o_{c_4c_5} o_{c_2c_5} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{c_5}} \left(\frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right) \\
&= \{ \mathbf{O}_1 \text{Diag} (2\ell_1 \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_1} \left(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1} \right), \dots, 2\ell_n \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_n} \left(\frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n} \right)) \mathbf{O}'_1 \tilde{\mathbf{F}} \}_{c_4c_3} \\
&= \{ \mathbf{O}_1 \text{Diag} (2\ell_1 \psi_1 \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_1} \left(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1} \right), \dots, 2\ell_n \psi_n \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_n} \left(\frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n} \right)) \mathbf{O}'_1 \}_{c_4c_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

A.3 Calculation for Proposition 2.2

Put $a = 1/(p + n + 1)$ and apply Theorem 2.4 with $\varphi_k = a(\ell_k + t/\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)$ ($k = 1, 2, \dots, n$).

Then we have, for $k = 1, 2, \dots, n$,

$$\begin{aligned}
\varphi_k^{(1)} &= \frac{(p-n-1)a^2}{\ell_k} \left(\ell_k + \frac{t}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+} \right)^2 + 4a^2 \left(\ell_k + \frac{t}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+} \right) \left(1 + \frac{t}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \right) \\
&\quad + 2a^2(n-1) \left(\ell_k + \frac{t}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+} \right) \\
&= a\ell_k + 2a^2 \left(\frac{p}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+} + \frac{2}{\ell_k (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{p-n-1}{\ell_k (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} + \frac{4}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \right) t^2.
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
&R(\widehat{\Sigma}_{\text{HF}}, \Sigma) - R(\widehat{\Sigma}_a, \Sigma) \\
&= \mathbb{E} \left[\sum_{k=1}^n \left\{ (p-n-1) \left\{ 2a^2 \left(\frac{p}{\ell_k \text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+} + \frac{2}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{p-n-1}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} + \frac{4}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \right) t^2 \right. \right. \right. \\
&\quad \left. \left. - \frac{2a}{\ell_k (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)} t \right\} + 2 \left\{ 2a^2 \left(\frac{p}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} + \frac{4}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} - \frac{2}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{2(p-n-1)}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \right. \right. \right. \\
&\quad \left. \left. - \frac{p-n-1}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} + \frac{12}{\ell_k^4 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^4} - \frac{8}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \right) t^2 - \frac{2a}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} t \right\} \\
&\quad \left. \left. + \frac{4a^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-1} - \ell_b^{-1}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} \cdot t + \left(\frac{a^2(p-n-1)}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-1} - \ell_b^{-1}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} + \frac{4a^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-2} - \ell_b^{-2}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} \right) t^2 \right\} \right].
\end{aligned}$$

But we have

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-1} - \ell_b^{-1}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} &= \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_b - \ell_k}{\ell_k \ell_b (\ell_k - \ell_b)} = - \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k \ell_b} = - \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k} \sum_{b=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_b} + \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^2} \\ &= -(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2 + \text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2 \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-2} - \ell_b^{-2}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} &= \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_b - \ell_k}{\ell_k^2 \ell_b^2 (\ell_k - \ell_b)} = - \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k + \ell_b}{\ell_k^2 \ell_b^2} \\ &= - \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k} \sum_{b=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_b^2} + \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^3} - \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^2} \sum_{b=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_b} + \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^3} \\ &= -2(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+) \text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2 + 2\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^3. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore we have

$$\begin{aligned} &R(\widehat{\Sigma}_{\text{HF}}, \Sigma) - R(\widehat{\Sigma}_a, \Sigma) \\ &= \mathbb{E} \left[(p - n - 1) \left\{ 2a^2 \left(p + \frac{2\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{(p - n - 1)\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} + \frac{4\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \right) t^2 \right. \right. \\ &\quad \left. \left. - 2at \right\} + 2 \left\{ 2a^2 \left(\frac{p\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} + \frac{4\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} - \frac{2\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{2(p - n - 1)\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \right. \right. \\ &\quad \left. \left. - \frac{(p - n - 1)\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} + \frac{12\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^4}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^4} - \frac{8\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} \right) t^2 - \frac{2a\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} t \right\} \\ &\quad + \frac{4a^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} (-\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2 + \text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2 \cdot t + \left(\frac{a^2(p - n - 1)}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} (-\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2 + \text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2 \right) \\ &\quad \left. + \frac{4a^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^3} (-2(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+) \text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2 + 2\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^3) t^2 \right] \\ &< a \mathbb{E} \left[(p - n - 1) \left\{ 2a \left(p + \frac{2\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} \right) t + a \frac{(p - n + 3)\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} t^2 - 2t \right\} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + 2 \left\{ 2a \frac{(p + 2)\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} t + a \frac{(p - n + 3)\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} t^2 - \frac{2\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2} t \right\} \right]. \end{aligned}$$

Since the coefficients of $\{\text{Tr } (\mathbf{S}^+)^2 / (\text{Tr } \mathbf{S}^+)^2\} t$ is evaluated as

$$2a(p - n - 1) + 4a(p + 1) - 4 = 2a(p - n - 1) - 4a(n - 1) < 2a(p - n - 1),$$

we have

$$\{2a(p-n-1) + 4a(p+1) - 4\} \frac{\text{Tr}(\mathbf{S}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{S}^+)^2} t < 2a(p-n-1)t,$$

from which it follows that

$$R(\widehat{\Sigma}_{\text{HF}}, \Sigma) - R(\widehat{\Sigma}_a, \Sigma) < a^2 \{(p-n+1)(p-n+3)t^2 - 2(n-1)(p-n-1)t\}.$$

This completes the proof. \square

A.4 Calculation for the proof of Theorem 3.2

Verification of A_4 :

$$\begin{aligned} A_4 &= \sum_{c_1, c_3, c_4=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p z_{c_1 c_2} \psi_{c_3} \bar{u}_{j c_3} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \sum_{c_4=1}^p \frac{u_{c_2 b} \bar{u}_{c_4 b} u_{i c_3} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_4}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_4=1}^p \frac{u_{c_2 b} \bar{u}_{c_4 b} u_{i c_3} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_4}}{\ell_{c_3}} \right\} \\ &= \sum_{c_3=1}^n u_{i c_3} \bar{u}_{j c_3} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \frac{\psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} \{U'_1 \mathbf{Z}' \bar{\mathbf{Z}} \bar{U}_1\}_{bb} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \frac{\psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3}} \{U'_2 \mathbf{Z}' \bar{\mathbf{Z}} \bar{U}_2\}_{bb} \right\} \\ &= \sum_{c_3=1}^n u_{i c_3} \bar{u}_{j c_3} \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \frac{\ell_b \psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b}. \end{aligned}$$

\square

Verification of A_5 :

$$\begin{aligned} A_5 &= \sum_{c_1, c_3, c_4=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p z_{c_1 c_2} \psi_{c_3} u_{c_2 c_3} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_3}^n \frac{\bar{u}_{j b} u_{i b} \bar{u}_{c_4 c_3} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_4}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{j b} u_{i b} \bar{u}_{c_4 c_3} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_4}}{\ell_{c_3}} \right\} \\ &= \sum_{b=1}^n \sum_{c_3 \neq b}^n \frac{u_{i b} \bar{u}_{j b} \psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} \{U'_1 \mathbf{Z}' \bar{\mathbf{Z}} \bar{U}_1\}_{c_3 c_3} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_3=1}^n \{U'_1 \mathbf{Z}' \bar{\mathbf{Z}} \bar{U}_1\}_{c_3 c_3} \frac{u_{i b} \bar{u}_{j b} \psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3}} \\ &= \sum_{b=1}^n u_{i b} \bar{u}_{j b} \sum_{c_3 \neq b}^n \frac{\ell_{c_3} \psi_{c_3}}{\ell_{c_3} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p u_{i b} \bar{u}_{j b} \sum_{c_3=1}^n \psi_{c_3}. \end{aligned}$$

\square

Verification of A_6 :

$$\begin{aligned}
A_6 &= \sum_{c_1, c_3, c_4, m=1}^n \sum_{c_2=1}^p z_{c_1 c_2} u_{c_2 c_3} \bar{u}_{j c_3} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_3}}{\partial \ell_m} \bar{u}_{c_4 m} u_{im} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_4} \\
&= \sum_{c_3, m=1}^n u_{im} \bar{u}_{j c_3} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_3}}{\partial \ell_m} \{U'_1 \mathbf{Z}' \bar{\mathbf{Z}} \bar{U}_1\}_{c_3 m} = \sum_{c_3=1}^n u_{ic_3} \bar{u}_{j c_3} \ell_{c_3} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_3}}{\partial \ell_{c_3}}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

A.5 Calculation for Theorem 3.3

Verification of $T_{c_4 c_2}^{(31)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4 c_2}^{(31)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{i=1}^p z_{c_1 c_2} \psi_{c_5} \bar{u}_{i c_5} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{u_{c_4 b} \bar{u}_{c_6 b} u_{i c_5} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_6}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{u_{c_4 b} \bar{u}_{c_6 b} u_{i c_5} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_6}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_n}) U_1^* \mathbf{Z}^* \mathbf{Z}\}_{c_4 c_2} + \{U_2 U_2^* \mathbf{Z}^* \mathbf{Z}\}_{c_4 c_2} \sum_{c_5}^n \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_1 \psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_1}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_n \psi_b}{\ell_b - \ell_n}) U_1^*\}_{c_4 c_2}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of $T_{c_4 c_2}^{(32)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4 c_2}^{(32)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{i=1}^p z_{c_1 c_2} \psi_{c_5} \bar{u}_{i c_5} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{i b} u_{i b} \bar{u}_{c_6 c_5} z_{c_1 c_6}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{i b} u_{i b} \bar{u}_{c_6 c_5} z_{c_1 c_6}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1 - \ell_b}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n - \ell_b}) U_1^* \mathbf{Z}^* \mathbf{Z}\}_{c_4 c_2} \\
&\quad + (p-n) \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1}, \dots, \frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n}) U_1^* \mathbf{Z}^* \mathbf{Z}\}_{c_4 c_2} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_1 \psi_1}{\ell_1 - \ell_b}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_n \psi_n}{\ell_n - \ell_b}) U_1^*\}_{c_4 c_2} \\
&\quad + (p-n) \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\psi_1, \dots, \psi_n) U_1^*\}_{c_4 c_2}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of $T_{c_4c_2}^{(33)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4c_2}^{(33)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5, m=1}^n \sum_{i=1}^p z_{c_1c_2} u_{c_4c_5} \bar{u}_{ic_5} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_5}}{\partial \ell_m} \sum_{c_6=1}^p \bar{u}_{c_6m} \bar{z}_{c_1c_6} u_{im} \\
&= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p z_{c_1c_2} u_{c_4c_5} \frac{\partial \psi_{c_5}}{\partial \ell_{c_5}} \bar{u}_{c_6c_5} \bar{z}_{c_1c_6} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\frac{\partial \psi_1}{\partial \ell_1}, \dots, \frac{\partial \psi_n}{\partial \ell_n}) U_1^* Z^* Z\}_{c_4c_2} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\ell_1 \frac{\partial \psi_1}{\partial \ell_1}, \dots, \ell_n \frac{\partial \psi_n}{\partial \ell_n}) U_1^*\}_{c_4c_2}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of $T_{c_4c_3}^{(41)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4c_3}^{(41)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_2, i=1}^p z_{c_1c_2} \tilde{f}_{c_4i} \bar{u}_{c_3c_5} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{u_{c_2b} \bar{u}_{c_6b} u_{ic_5} \bar{z}_{c_1c_6}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{u_{c_2b} \bar{u}_{c_6b} u_{ic_5} \bar{z}_{c_1c_6}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \sum_{c_5=1}^n \sum_{i=1}^p \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \tilde{f}_{c_4i} \bar{u}_{c_3c_5} u_{ic_5} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_4}} \frac{\{U_1' Z' \bar{Z} \bar{U}_1\}_{bb}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_5=1}^n \sum_{i=1}^p \tilde{f}_{c_4i} \bar{u}_{c_3c_5} u_{ic_5} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_4}} \frac{\{U_2' Z' \bar{Z} \bar{U}_2\}_{bb}}{\ell_{c_5}} \\
&= \{\tilde{F} U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_b \psi_1}{\ell_1(\ell_1 - \ell_b)}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_b \psi_n}{\ell_n(\ell_n - \ell_b)}) U_1^*\}_{c_4c_3} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\ell_b \psi_1^2}{\ell_1(\ell_1 - \ell_b)}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\ell_b \psi_n^2}{\ell_n(\ell_n - \ell_b)}) U_1^*\}_{c_4c_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of $T_{c_4c_3}^{(42)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4c_3}^{(42)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_2, i=1}^p z_{c_1c_2} \tilde{f}_{c_4i} u_{c_2c_5} \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \left\{ \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{c_3b} u_{ib} \bar{u}_{c_6c_5} \bar{z}_{c_1c_6}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_6=1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{c_3b} u_{ib} \bar{u}_{c_6c_5} \bar{z}_{c_1c_6}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right\} \\
&= \sum_{c_5=1}^n \sum_{i=1}^p \sum_{b \neq c_5}^n \tilde{f}_{c_4i} u_{ib} \bar{u}_{c_3b} \frac{\{U_1^* Z^* Z U_1\}_{c_5c_5} \psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5} - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_5=1}^n \sum_{i=1}^p \tilde{f}_{c_4i} u_{ib} \bar{u}_{c_3b} \frac{\{U_1^* Z^* Z U_1\}_{c_5c_5} \psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}^2} \\
&= \{\tilde{F} U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b(\ell_b - \ell_1)}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_b}{\ell_b(\ell_b - \ell_n)}) U_1^*\}_{c_4c_3} + \{\tilde{F} U_2 U_2^*\}_{c_4c_3} \sum_{c_5=1}^n \frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \\
&= \{U_1 \text{Diag}(\sum_{b \neq 1} \frac{\psi_1 \psi_b}{\ell_b(\ell_b - \ell_1)}, \dots, \sum_{b \neq n} \frac{\psi_n \psi_b}{\ell_b(\ell_b - \ell_n)}) U_1^*\}_{c_4c_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

Verification of $T_{c_4 c_3}^{(43)}$:

$$\begin{aligned}
T_{c_4 c_3}^{(43)} &= \sum_{c_1, c_5, m=1}^n \sum_{c_2, i=1}^p z_{c_1 c_2} \tilde{f}_{c_4 i} u_{c_2 c_5} \bar{u}_{c_3 c_5} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_m} \left(\frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right) \sum_{c_6=1}^p \bar{u}_{c_6 m} \bar{z}_{c_1 c_6} u_{im} \\
&= \sum_{c_1, c_5=1}^n \sum_{c_6=1}^p \tilde{f}_{c_4 i} u_{i c_5} \bar{u}_{c_3 c_5} \ell_{c_5} \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_{c_5}} \left(\frac{\psi_{c_5}}{\ell_{c_5}} \right) \\
&= \{ \tilde{\mathbf{F}} \mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\ell_1 \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_1} \left(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1} \right), \dots, \ell_n \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_n} \left(\frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n} \right)) \mathbf{U}_1^* \mathbf{Z}^* \mathbf{Z} \}_{c_4 c_3} \\
&= \{ \mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{Diag}(\ell_1 \psi_1 \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_1} \left(\frac{\psi_1}{\ell_1} \right), \dots, \ell_n \psi_n \frac{\partial}{\partial \ell_n} \left(\frac{\psi_n}{\ell_n} \right)) \mathbf{U}_1^* \}_{c_4 c_3}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

A.6 Verification of the third equation in Lemma 4.2

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial \bar{u}_{ak}}{\partial z_{ij}} &= \sum_{b=1, c_1=1}^p \bar{u}_{ab} u_{c_1 b} \frac{\partial \bar{u}_{c_1 k}}{\partial z_{ij}} \\
&= \sum_{b=1}^n \bar{u}_{ab} \{ \mathbf{U}'_1 (d\bar{\mathbf{U}}_1) \}_{bk} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial z_{ij}} \right) + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \bar{u}_{ab} \{ \mathbf{U}'_2 (d\bar{\mathbf{U}}_1) \}_{bk} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial z_{ij}} \right) \\
&= \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\bar{u}_{ab}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} \{ \mathbf{U}'_1 ((d\mathbf{Z}') \bar{\mathbf{Z}} + \mathbf{Z}' (d\bar{\mathbf{Z}})) \bar{\mathbf{U}}_1 \}_{bk} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial z_{ij}} \right) \\
&\quad + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{ab}}{\ell_k} \{ \mathbf{U}'_2 ((d\mathbf{Z}') \bar{\mathbf{Z}} + \mathbf{Z}' (d\bar{\mathbf{Z}})) \bar{\mathbf{U}}_1 \}_{bk} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial z_{ij}} \right) \\
&= \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\bar{u}_{ab} u_{c_1 b} \bar{u}_{c_3 k}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} \{ (dz_{c_2 c_1}) \bar{z}_{c_2 c_3} + z_{c_2 c_1} (d\bar{z}_{c_2 c_3}) \} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial z_{ij}} \right) \\
&\quad + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{ab} u_{c_1 b} \bar{u}_{c_3 k}}{\ell_k} \{ (dz_{c_2 c_1}) \bar{z}_{c_2 c_3} + z_{c_2 c_1} (d\bar{z}_{c_2 c_3}) \} \left(\frac{\partial}{\partial z_{ij}} \right) \\
&= \sum_{b \neq k}^n \sum_{c_1=1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{ab} u_{j b} \bar{u}_{c_1 k} \bar{z}_{i c_1}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} + \sum_{b=n+1}^p \sum_{c_1=1}^p \frac{\bar{u}_{ab} u_{j b} \bar{u}_{c_1 k} \bar{z}_{i c_1}}{\ell_k}.
\end{aligned}$$

□

A.7 Calculation for Proposition 3.2

Put $a = 1/(p+n)$ and apply Theorem 2.4 with $\varphi_k = a(\ell_k + t/\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)$ ($k = 1, 2, \dots, n$). Then we have, for $k = 1, 2, \dots, n$,

$$\begin{aligned}\varphi_k^{(1)} &= \frac{(p-n)a^2}{\ell_k} \left(\ell_k + \frac{t}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+} \right)^2 + 2a^2 \left(\ell_k + \frac{t}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+} \right) \left(1 + \frac{t}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \right) \\ &\quad + 2a^2(n-1) \left(\ell_k + \frac{t}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+} \right) \\ &= a\ell_k + 2a^2 \left(\frac{p}{\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+} + \frac{1}{\ell_k (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{p-n}{\ell_k (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} + \frac{2}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \right) t^2.\end{aligned}$$

Therefore, we have

$$\begin{aligned}&R(\widehat{\Sigma}_{\text{HF}}, \Sigma) - R(\widehat{\Sigma}_a, \Sigma) \\ &= \mathbb{E} \left[\sum_{k=1}^n \left\{ (p-n) \left\{ 2a^2 \left(\frac{p}{\ell_k \text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+} + \frac{1}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{p-n}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} + \frac{2}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \right) t^2 \right. \right. \\ &\quad - \frac{2a}{\ell_k (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)} t \left. \right\} + \left\{ 2a^2 \left(\frac{p}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} + \frac{2}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^3} - \frac{1}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{2(p-n)}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \right. \right. \\ &\quad - \frac{p-n}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} + \frac{6}{\ell_k^4 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^4} - \frac{4}{\ell_k^3 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \left. \right) t^2 - \frac{2a}{\ell_k^2 (\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} t \left. \right\} \\ &\quad \left. + \frac{2a^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-1} - \ell_b^{-1}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} \cdot t + \left(\frac{a^2(p-n)}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-1} - \ell_b^{-1}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} + \frac{2a^2}{(\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-2} - \ell_b^{-2}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} \right) t^2 \right\} \right].\end{aligned}$$

But we have

$$\begin{aligned}\sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-1} - \ell_b^{-1}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} &= \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_b - \ell_k}{\ell_k \ell_b (\ell_k - \ell_b)} = - \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k \ell_b} = - \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k} \sum_{b=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_b} + \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^2} \\ &= -(\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+)^2 + \text{Tr } (\mathbf{W}^+)^2\end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}\sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k^{-2} - \ell_b^{-2}}{\ell_k - \ell_b} &= \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_b - \ell_k}{\ell_k^2 \ell_b^2 (\ell_k - \ell_b)} = - \sum_{k=1}^n \sum_{b \neq k}^n \frac{\ell_k + \ell_b}{\ell_k^2 \ell_b^2} \\ &= - \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k} \sum_{b=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_b^2} + \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^3} - \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^2} \sum_{b=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_b} + \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{\ell_k^3} \\ &= -2(\text{Tr } \mathbf{W}^+) \text{Tr } (\mathbf{W}^+)^2 + 2\text{Tr } (\mathbf{W}^+)^3.\end{aligned}$$

Therefore we have

$$\begin{aligned}
& R(\widehat{\Sigma}_{\text{HF}}, \Sigma) - R(\widehat{\Sigma}_a, \Sigma) \\
&= \mathbb{E} \left[(p-n) \left\{ 2a^2 \left(p + \frac{\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{(p-n)\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} + \frac{2\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \right) t^2 \right. \right. \\
&\quad \left. \left. - 2at \right\} + \left\{ 2a^2 \left(\frac{p\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} + \frac{2\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^3} - \frac{\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \right) t + a^2 \left(\frac{2(p-n)\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \right. \right. \\
&\quad \left. \left. - \frac{(p-n)\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} + \frac{6\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^4}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^4} - \frac{4\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^3}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^3} \right) t^2 - \frac{2a\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} t \right\} \\
&\quad + \frac{2a^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} (-(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2 + \text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2) \cdot t + \left(\frac{a^2(p-n)}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} (-(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2 + \text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{2a^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^3} (-2(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2 + 2\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^3) \right) t^2 \Big] \\
&< a \mathbb{E} \left[(p-n) \left\{ 2a \left(p + \frac{\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} \right) t + a \frac{(p-n+2)\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} t^2 - 2t \right\} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \left\{ 2a \frac{(p+1)\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} t + a \frac{(p-n+2)\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} t^2 - \frac{2\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} t \right\} \right].
\end{aligned}$$

Since the coefficients of $\{\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2/(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2\}t$ is evaluated as

$$2a(p-n) + 2a(p+1) - 2 = 2a(p-n) - 2a(n-1) < 2a(p-n),$$

we have

$$\{2a(p-n) + 2a(p+1) - 2\} \frac{\text{Tr}(\mathbf{W}^+)^2}{(\text{Tr} \mathbf{W}^+)^2} t < 2a(p-n)t,$$

from which it follows that

$$R(\widehat{\Sigma}_{\text{HF}}, \Sigma) - R(\widehat{\Sigma}_a, \Sigma) < a^2 \{(p-n+2)(p-n+1)t^2 - 2(n-1)(p-n)t\}.$$

This completes the proof. □